



734064, ш. Душанбе, кӯчаи Шамсӣ 5/1, ошёнӣ 6, 5/1 Shamsi str., 6th floor, 734064, Dushanbe
Факс/Fax: (+99237) 2357416, Тел/Tel: 2357417, E-mail: grpsgs@gmail.com, сомона: www.energyprojects.tj

Minutes of the meeting on consultations on the ESIA, RAP2 and LRP 2.
Meeting on the dissemination of information in civil society.

Date: September 11, 2025

Venue: DFZ, Dushanbe

Chairman: Bakhtiyor Begmuradov - Senior E&S specialist, PMG EFC

Participants (in person):

Graciela Sanchez Martinez, Senior Social Development Specialist, World Bank
Mamanbek Reimov – Social Development Specialist, World Bank
Obaidullah Hidayat – Environmental Specialist, World Bank
Rustam Saidzoda – Deputy Director, DFZ
Ayub Fayzullozoda – Social Development Specialist, DFZ
Asligul Mamadatoeva - Social Development Specialist, PMG EFC
Zarina Urakova – Gender Specialist, PMG EFC
Sanavbar Sherova – Communications Specialist, PMG EFC
Farkhod Ulugov – Environmental Specialist, PMG EFC
Sarboz Musulmonkulov – Senior Translator, PMG EFC
Oraz Rakhmatulloev – Project Coordinator, NSIFT
Sanovbar Khakimova – Social Development Specialist, NSIFT
Kurbonova Manizha – Journalist/Civil society activist
Kamollidin Sirojiddinov – Independent expert/ Civil society activist
Yuri Skochilov – Director of the NGO “Youth Ecological Center”
Boboev Jura, member of the PA “Association of Power Engineers of Tajikistan”
Rafika Musoeva – Chairman of the PA “Association of Power Engineers of Tajikistan”
Sirojev Bahrom, member of the PA “Association of Power Engineers of Tajikistan”
Uwaydullozoda Golib, member of the PA “Association of Power Engineers of Tajikistan”
Kaibov Loik, member of the PA “Association of Power Engineers of Tajikistan”
Olimov Sirojiddin – Head of the Migration and Social Affairs Department, Ministry of Labor of the Republic of Tajikistan
Abdullayeva Marhabo – PA “Association of Insurance Authorities of Tajikistan”
Hayitov Khol – NGO “SO Mehnatchi”
Nigmatov Jahongir – consultant of PA “Association of Power Engineers of Tajikistan”
Sadi Haidar – Social Development Specialist, NSIFT
Dilafruz Zoirova – Public Relations Specialist

Online: Alexander Kolotov, Director of NGO “River without Boundaries Coalition”
Evgeny Simonov, International coordinator of NGO “River without Boundaries Coalition”
Chinara Aidibayeva, Public Fund “Nash Vek”
Shahlo Abdunabizoda, Director of Public Organization “Jahon”
Mavlon Hokimalizoda, Director of the Branch of the Executive Committee of the International Fund for Saving the Aral Sea (IFAS) in the Republic of Tajikistan

The agenda

1. Presentation of the ESIA, RAP2 and LRP2
2. Questions and comments from members of the public
3. Closing remarks and agreements on further actions

Course of the meeting

Opening remarks

The Chairman Mr. B. Begmuradov opened the meeting, thanked the participants and noted that the discussion would be devoted to environmental and social issues related to the implementation of the Rogun HPP project and presented in the project documents under discussion. B. Begmuradov also introduced representatives of the World Bank and DFZ and asked all speakers to further introduce themselves during the meeting.

ESIA presentation

The presentation of the ESIA was made by Ms. Sanavbar Sherova, Communications specialist.

The report includes:

- Volume 1 – The most significant potential impacts.
- Volume 2 – Nine Technical Annexes.
- Volume 3 – Environmental and Social Management Plan.

Presentation of the RAP2/ LRP2

The presentation was made by Mr. Ayub Fayzullozoda, DFZ Social Development Specialist

Presentation of the LRP2 (Socio-Economic Resilience Strengthening Project)

The presentation was made by Ms. Sanovbar Khakimova, Social Development Specialist at the NSIFT

Questions and comments

1. Alexander Kolotov, Director of the Rivers Without Boundaries Coalition, made a number of comments, namely regarding the deadlines for submitting comments, individual consultations on the RAP and key issues of the ESIA, regarding the agenda of consultations, namely the amount of time allocated for discussing documents. And the last question is about the coverage of the documents by the WB and Rogun HPP website, namely, it is indicated that the documents are not provided on the World Bank's website in full

Mr. Begmuradov's response: Asked him to provide all questions and comments in writing for further consideration. Regarding the timing, it was pointed out that the announcement was posted a month before the consultations, and that this was enough to prepare comments and questions about the ES tools, and it was also noted that the ES tools are a "live" document, and all constructive comments will be taken into account and implemented in the ES tools.

2. Mr. Kamolidin Sirojiddinov, a local expert and representative of the local community: asked 3 questions about all the presentations (1 question for each presentation). 1 question regarding the Tractabel ER and e, not a word was said about the PMC, but it is unclear what state the PMC selection process is in.

Answer to question 1, Mr. B. Begmuradov: It is noted that the tender is in the selection process, and the finalist of the selection will be announced by the end of the year. The PMC can start working in full only by the summer of next year, as soon as the current ER transfers in next six months all responsibility and information regarding the project to the future PMC.

The next question concerned the transportation of property of displaced persons (forms of payment for displaced persons, whether the volume of cargo of the displaced person is taken into account in compensation, as well as the organization of transportation of personal property)

Response from Mr. Saidzoda Rustam, Deputy Director of the DFZ: Noted that resettlement activities are carried out on the basis of the DFZ regulations, namely on a tender basis by selecting a contractor to provide services for the transportation of personal property of displaced persons.

The following comment on the NSIFT: It is noted that the date of the organization was indicated incorrectly, namely it is February 1997. And the issue of corruption in the process of NSIF projects.

The answer of Mr. Oraz Rahmatullayev, coordinator of the NSIFT project: The selection is carried out by an inclusive method, namely, the public chooses what to build. Another point in the project is the social audit: at the beginning, in the middle and at the end of the project. It was also noted that in all villages there is an independent commission consisting of local representatives.

Question from Mr. Jura Boboev, member of the Association of Power Engineers of the Republic of Tatarstan: there are no jobs in the resettled settlements and there is a shortage of teachers in schools.

Mr. Saidzoda's answer: The infrastructure in all villages has been built, and the Ministry of Labor holds job fairs on a regular basis.

Addendum from the representative of the Ministry of Labor: Confirmed information about holding fairs and providing employment opportunities in relocated places.

Mr. Begmuradov's addition: with the construction of the Rogun HPP, it will create new jobs and ensure the long-term prosperity of the republic's economy.

Addendum from Mr. Uwaydullozoda Golib, representative of the Association of Power Engineers of the Republic of Tatarstan: confirmed the difficulties with employment at the moment in the Republic, and also noted that after the completion of the Rogun HPP, many problems with employment of the population will disappear by themselves, as lack of energy limits the growth of the republic's economy.

Question and comment from Ms. Musoeva R, Chairman of the Association of Power Engineers of the Republic of Tatarstan: Who evaluates the development of resettlement

opportunities for displaced persons, namely, the euphoria of the development of displaced persons is beginning to subside. (access to electricity, schools, housing, etc.). How many of the displaced women work and how many of them study? Are there any benefits for the displaced after the completion of the construction of the Rogun hydroelectric power station?

Answer by Mr. Ayub Fayzullozoda: The answer to the first question is, after the restructuring of the DFZ, the Monitoring Department monitors the activities, and there are also DFZ representative offices on the ground that deal with all pressing issues, as well as issues of the GV.

Comment from Ms. Musoeva: I am interested in figures, specific figures for students, joint activities under the Ministry of Labor, namely questions about post-resettlement activities for displaced people.

Mr. Begmuradov's answer: All figures will be provided in writing, as such data is not available at this meeting. Then he informed that international consulting company "Insuco" has also been hired to monitor DFZ activities.

Question from Evgeny Simonov, international coordinator of the Rivers Without Borders Coalition: The RAP2 plan is not complete, but only fragments of activities (which activities, where and what, and at what stage is not clear). Or regarding the documents on the ESIA "Transboundary cumulative impact", it was noted that the chapter itself is missing, but there is only an appendix. There is also a link to the assessment of the basic situation and does not contain any specifics and consists of 3.5 pages. There is no reflection of all previous correspondence and comments from past consultations. All climate change activities are not reflected in this ESIA. Volume 3 does not have a table of contents (i.e. it is inconvenient to navigate through the document). The figures for all documents vary, for example, by the time of flooding, by the time of completion of construction and by electricity generation. (17,000 MW in the updated ESIA and 14,000 MW in the 2014 ESIA). Also, the information in the updated ESIA does not reflect the tables that reflect which proposals have been received and how they are reflected in the updated ESIA.

Mr. Begmuradov's asked you to send all comments in writing. And to the comment that no 15 comments from previous consultations were sent, but only complaints not related to the content of the ESIA.

Question from Ms. Abdullayeva Markhabo, representative of the Association of Power Engineers of the Republic of Tatarstan: Is the property of displaced people insured against accidents and fires during transportation?

Mr. Saidzoda's answer: The company responsible for transporting the personal property of displaced people is responsible for the safety and integrity of the displaced persons' property during their transportation.

Mr. Begmuradov's addition: it would be nice to insure property, but this is a voluntary matter.

Mr. Fayzullozoda's addition: there is a protocol that provides for the full responsibility of companies transporting personal property of displaced persons for the integrity and safety of personal belongings of displaced persons.

Mr. Skochilov's question: A question about biodiversity. Measures are envisaged regarding Tigrovaya Balka as a valuable facility, but the document does not provide for any measures to mitigate the impact on the facility. Why are there no events planned for Tigrovaya Balka? It was

also noted that as per ESIA the YEC is engaged in saxaul, but in fact the YEC is engaged in floodplain forests.

Mr. Begmuradov's reply: We will definitely bring to the attention of our consultants that the YEC is not engaged in planting saxaul but floodplain vegetation only. Also, the impact of the Rogun HPP project does not extend beyond the Nurek HPP. Regarding the "No net loss framework" concept, the option of taking measures for Tigrovaya Balka was also considered, but another option was chosen, namely the restoration of juniper forests. The issue of "Tigrovaya Balka Reserve" should be raised in other forums or in the framework of special project.

Comment by Mr. Sirozhev Bakhrom, representative of the Association of Power Engineers of the Republic of Tatarstan: The World Bank does not finance the Rogun HPP project in full but only organizes the framework for financing by other financial institutions. The second point is about electricity generation; it is in average 14 GW and depends on the inflow and varies up to 1.2 GW. It's also worth remembering that Rogun will increase electricity generation at other hydroelectric power plants in the cascade. Thus, in total surplus could reach the stated 17 GW. And the third point about Tigrovaya Balka is that the impact of the project is limited to the Nurek HPP.

Mr. Sirojiddinov's comment: I expressed my gratitude to all the consultants involved in conducting the study. Very painstaking and comprehensive work has been carried out in the updated ESIA, provided in August this year. For example, data on cumulative impacts, mudflow impacts of Obi Shur, etc. are given. But there is one problem in attracting personnel, namely, where there are more than 300 specialists in ES standards. Therefore, I propose to allocate World Bank funding and develop a program for the training and retraining of ES specialists. Such a program is very important, as with the entry into force of financing, we will face a shortage of specialists in the implementation of the project. Another question concerns the request of the Rivers Without Boundaries staff to extend the deadline for providing comments, as there is a lot of information, and to officially extend the provision of comments until October 1 of this year.

Mr. Begmuradov's reply: Thanks for the comment. Regarding the personnel, I agree that such a problem exists and your comments are very valuable. Perhaps even this your suggestion will be taken into account. A Project Management Consultant will also be hired as part of the project, and the main burden of attracting specialists will fall on the shoulders of this company. Regarding the second part of your comment, I would like to remind you once again that this document is "live" and all constructive comments and observations will be taken into account even after the deadline for submission.

Mr. Sirojiddinov noted that international consultant will not take comments into account after the end of their contract, and the fact that you assure us that comments will be taken into account in the future is your personal opinion and opinion of the PMG. This issue should be discussed with representatives of the World Bank and international consultant.

Mr. Fayzullozoda's addition: All comments are collected from 2023 and this ESIA takes into account all past comments.

Comment from Ms. Musoeva: This is a national-wide project, and all those involved in the implementation of this project will be inducted into the Rogun HPP Construction Hall of Fame. The Rogun HPP project will also extend the life of the Nurek HPP for a hundred years. And this project is very important for the country, as well as the production of environmentally friendly electricity, the creation of new jobs, not only in the republic, but also in those countries where it is exported, when it has been completed. And a very important point is that the population will have uninterrupted access to electricity. The benefits of the project, of course, are much greater. It was also noted that the displaced people receive a completely new and high-quality standard of living, which is also a positive impact from the project. Dam safety, environmental issues, etc. were

strengthened. Thanks were expressed to the World Bank for the introduction of ES standards, as this allows the introduction of new technologies and this is for the benefit of our country and society. Support was also expressed with comments on the training and retraining of specialists in ES standards. It would be a good idea to hold such consultations at least once a quarter to discuss pressing issues and ensure transparency. For example, how much energy was sold, at what tariffs, where did its money go, how many women were trained, how many were employed, etc. The participation of civil society should be involved in all stages of the development of the Rogun HPP.

A question from a participant named Chinara Aydbayeva, a representative of the “Nash Vek” Public Foundation: The risks of an earthquake, namely the consequences of an earthquake. The document considers only the damage to the dam itself and the buildings of the displaced, without a broad impact and cascading effect. For example, an earthquake can cause indirect landslides, lead to overflows in case of a faulty spillway, cause man-made accidents, collapse of tunnels and power line infrastructure. And the second question is about computer modeling, which was discussed at previous consultations, is this modeling ready and can it be viewed?

Mr. Begmuradov's answer: This is a very important question. The Rogun HPP project is located in a seismic zone and a study was conducted at the request of independent Dam Safety Panel of Experts. To be more precise, such a study was conducted in 2011 and this current study supplements previous. The survey was completed recently and, in the future, we could send you additional information on this matter, if that's acceptable to you.

Then, at the conclusion of the meeting, Mr. Begmuradov asked the World Bank representatives to speak out if they had any questions, suggestions or comments.

Mr. Obaidullah Hidayat: The WB have no comments, but most likely Mr. Maged and the rest of the consultants will watch the video of these consultations and give their comments. Thank you.

Mr. Begmuradov thanked all the participants and once again reminded them of the written comments that would need to be sent.

During the meeting, due to technical issues, some questions were submitted by participants via the chat.

These questions are presented in the table below, and a screenshot of the chat correspondence is attached to this protocol as an appendix. Responses to the questions submitted via chat are included in the relevant sections of the discussion above in the protocol.

Chat screenshot

